

WA/2024/00462 – Listed Building Consent for demolition and replacement of modern ground floor extension; first floor extension to catslide; repairs and internal alterations (as amended by drawings received 08 May and 03 June 2024), at FARNHAM LIBERAL CLUB, 46 SOUTH STREET, FARNHAM GU9 7RP

Applicant: Springmark Ltd
Parish: Farnham
Ward: Farnham Castle
Grid Reference: E: 484220
N: 146820
Case Officer: Alistair de Joux
Neighbour Notification Expiry Date: 01/04/2024
Expiry Date/Extended Expiry Date: 02/05/2024

Committee Meeting Date: Planning Committee 10/07/2024

RECOMMENDATION Subject to conditions, to **GRANT LISTED BUILDING CONSENT**

1. Site Description

The subject building is located in the south-eastern part of the Farnham Town Centre at the junction of South Street and Brightwells Road, and within the Town Centre Conservation Area. To the rear of the building there is a Building of Local Merit, at the Jubilee Arch, and a public community garden. Beyond that Falkner Court is a two-storey residential building with accommodation in the roofspace. The Methodist Church adjoins the southern side of the application site, while three red brick buildings ranging from two to four storeys in height (including roof space accommodation), are located on the opposite side of South Street, between the junctions with Victoria Road and Union Road. The Grade II listed United Reform Church is on the northern junction of Victoria Road, within 40m of the application site.

The Farnham Liberal Club is one of the earliest works of Sir Edwin Lutyens.

Outside the Conservation Area and on the opposite side of Brightwells Road, there is a single storey brick carparking building and exterior car parking adjacent to South Street, which services a Sainsburys supermarket 75 m to the north-west, and four storey flats to the east of carpark also on Brightwells Road, 30m to the north-east for the application site.

2. Proposal

The proposal is for demolition and replacement of the modern ground floor extension; first floor extension to catslide; repairs and internal alterations with outdoor seating to be provided on a first floor terrace forming part of the extension.

Amended drawings were submitted and were consulted on during the course of the application. The key external changes are to the Brightwells Road frontage, where the modern extension would be demolished and a part single, part two storey extension would be erected in its place. The amended drawings incorporate

- a more distinct separation between the rear corner of the original building and the extension has been provided by inserting new door within a recess immediately adjacent to this corner and setting the first floor element in from the line of the flank wall of the original and extended building. This in turn allows the edge of the catslide roof to remain visible along its full length.
- Amended ground floor windows facing Brightwells Road and an off-set oriel window above the recessed side door.
- Amended design of the rear of the two storey element, including the deletion of a chimney from the drawings originally submitted for the application, which was intended to house a ventilation flue serving a restaurant within the new extension.
- Amended boundary treatment for the street frontage and rear edges of the proposed roof terrace.

The amended plans also provide for the staircase to be retained in its original position.

3. Relevant Planning History

Reference	Proposal	Decision
WA/1990/0947	Application for Listed Building Consent for internal alterations.	Consent granted, 26/08/1990.

4. Relevant Planning Constraints

Grade II Listed Building

5. Relevant Development Plan Policies and Guidance

- Waverley Borough Local Plan (Part 1): Strategic policies and sites (adopted February 2018): Policy HA1;
- Waverley Borough Local Plan (Part 2): Site Allocations and Development Management Policies (adopted March 2023): Policies DM20 and DM21.

Other guidance:

- The National Planning Policy Framework 2021 (NPPF)
- The National Planning Practice Guidance 2014 (NPPG)
- Farnham Design Statement (2010)
- National Design Guide (2019)

6. Consultations and Town/Parish Council Comments

Farnham Town Council	No objection
WBC Heritage	No objection

7. Representations

7 letters have been received, which raise objections on the following grounds:

- It would be good to see repairs to this Lutyens building and the continued use of the building. However, the amount of additional space to be added with this application is very substantial and would seem to overshadow the original.
- The provision of bins is inadequate.
- Not enough has been done to delineate the existing cat side roof from new extensions.
- The balustrade proposed for the terrace is visually disruptive. The use of steel balustrading creates strong horizontal geometry which is visually confusing.
- Rainwater disposal does not appear to have been considered practically.
- A proposed elevation drawing notes 'Grey Slate to match existing'. The existing cat slide roof does not have real slate but substandard fibre tiles. To add these tiles on new roofs in a more prominent position will not be acceptable. Changing roof design to hips would also reduce impact of these new roofs.
- Proposed first floor will be poorly lit with no overhead or flank windows to cover the middle section. This design requires over-dependence on an artificial light source.
- Farnham (Building Preservation) Trust sponsored a condition survey some years ago which highlighted urgent repairs being needed. Our Trust would dearly love to see this building restored sympathetically using appropriate methods and materials and for the original form, much of which has been lost over the years, to be brought back as much as possible. There could be an increase in disturbance to neighbouring properties with noise and smells due to the intensification of use. Generally, we feel that the proposed extensions are too bulky and could lead to overlooking and overbearing to adjacent properties. The extensions detract from the adjacent Falkner Jubilee Arch which should be the dominant feature and detracts from the catslide roof. We oppose any application that detracts from these architectural features.

Concerns were also expressed in letters written for this application, regarding impacts related to the change of use. These are addressed in the full planning application report, ref. WA/2024/00461.

Heritage and Listed Building Considerations:

Sections 16 and 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states that in considering applications which affect Listed Buildings, Local Planning Authorities must have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Paragraph 203 of the NPPF sets out that:

In determining applications, local planning authorities should take account of:

- a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;*

- b) the positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and*
- c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.*

Policy HA1 of the Local Plan (Part 1) 2018 outlines that the Council will ensure that the significance of heritage assets are conserved or enhanced to ensure the continued protection and enjoyment of the historic environment.

Policy DM20 of the Local Plan (Part 2) 2023 (LPP2) sets out that development affecting Statutory Listed Buildings should preserve or enhance the buildings, their settings, and any features that they have that are of special architectural or historic interest.

Significance of heritage assets:

The Farnham Liberal Club is a 2 storey building, the front is composed of cross-windows in a field of the dark red and very thin bricks laid in stretcher bond, with alternating triangular and segmental moulded brick courses making pediments over the first-floor windows. Designed in 1894, it is one of Sir Edwin Lutyens' earliest works and his first in the Queen Anne style, at a time when his designs were still very Surrey Vernacular. The left-hand flank is of unrelieved purple-brown three inch brick, this elevation was presumably expected to be concealed by continuous development along South Street. The interior of the building has been significantly altered internally.

The Jubilee Arch was built for Queen Victoria's Jubilee in 1897 to the design of Harold Falkner, his first outside commission. It is a symmetrical structure in dark and light red brick, about 5.5m high. The middle bay with segmental arch slightly projects. It was the former entrance to the swimming baths which is now a community garden. It is the landmark feature along Brightwells Road.

The Farnham Town Centre Conservation Area's significance lies in its history as a successful market town for which its profitable hop trade is evident through the 18th century architecture. It was then significantly altered by a group of local Arts and crafts architects in the early 20th century. The town has a defined street pattern of a linear layout with main frontages and the yards and alleys to the rear, with distinctive undulating roofscapes (such as the hop kilns). South Street was set out in 1869 as New Road, connecting The Borough to the railway station. This was the first major change to the medieval street pattern. By 1900 it had become the civic street of the town, with public buildings and institutions as well as nonconformist churches.

The existing extensions at the rear of the building do not contribute to the significance of the listed building or the character and appearance of the conservation area, therefore the principle of their demolition / alteration is acceptable. As a result of the listed building's unrelieved elevation Brightwells Road and the Jubilee Arch being the landmark feature, a modest scheme is the most appropriate.

A revised scheme has been submitted following an identification of harm to the heritage assets. This includes the retention of the staircase in its original location, removal of the flue and alterations to the extensions. The proposed extensions have been reduced in height and the design altered this helps reduce its bulk. The oriel window and other

features on the north elevation adds interest to the elevation without dominating the street scene and jubilee arch. Therefore, no harm to the heritage assets is identified and the character and appearance of the conservation area will be preserved.

8. Conclusion

In considering the revised scheme, the local planning authority has had special regard to the desirability of preserving the building, its setting, and its features of special architectural and historic interest which it possesses, in accordance with Sections 16 and 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990. It is considered that the revised scheme is acceptable in heritage terms, and that the proposal result in no harm to the heritage asset. As such, the recommendation is as follows:

Recommendation

That listed building consent be GRANTED, subject to the following conditions:

1. Condition:

The plan numbers to which this permission relates are

FL23-2110-050 - Site Location Plan
FL23-2110-060 rev. G - Proposed Site Plan
FL23-2110-065 rev. G - Proposed Site Plan (Coloured)
FL23-2110-067 rev. C - Refuse Strategy
FL23-2110-100 rev. L - Proposed Street Scenes
FL23-2110-105 rev. M - Proposed Floor Plans
FL23-2110-110 rev. S - Proposed Elevations
FL23-2110-115 rev. P - Proposed Building Sections
FL23-2110-120 rev. E - AC Route

The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans. No material variation from these plans shall take place unless otherwise first agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason:

In order that the development hereby permitted shall be fully implemented in complete accordance with the approved plans and to accord with Policy HA1 of the Local Plan (Part 1) 2018 and Policies DM20 and DM22 of the Local Plan (Part 2) 2023.

2. Condition:

Prior to commencement of works to the listed building, drawings to a scale not smaller than 1:10 fully describing the following details must be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority:

- a) New and/or replacement windows and external doors, to show:
- decorative and protective finishes;
 - cross section of frame, transom, mullions, glazing bars, etc;

- formation of openings including reveals, heads, sills, arches, lintels, etc;
- method of opening; and
- method of glazing.

b) Roof details, including sections through:

- roof ridge
- hips
- valleys
- verges
- eaves

The approved works must not be executed other than in complete accordance with these approved details.

Reason:

To preserve the historic interest of the listed building and its setting, in accordance with Policy HA1 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan (Part 1) 2018, Policies DM20 and DM22 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan (Part 2) 2023 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2023.

3. Condition:

Prior to commencement samples or specifications of external materials and surface finishes must be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. This should include a specification of brickwork and including material, colour, texture, face bond, jointing / pointing profile; details of terrace screens; and details of rainwater goods (including gutters, down pipes and hopperheads) and external soil pipes which shall be of cast iron / cast aluminium. The works must not be executed other than in complete accordance with these approved details.

Reason:

To preserve the historic interest of the listed building and its setting, in accordance with Policy HA1 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan (Part 1) 2018, Policies DM20 and DM22 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan (Part 2) 2023 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2023.

4. Condition:

All building works, finishes, and making-good, both internal and external, shall match the relevant existing work in respect of method, detail, and finished appearance unless otherwise approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Where new materials are to be used externally, the colour match shall make allowance for future weathering

Reason:

To preserve the historic interest of the listed building and its setting, in accordance with Policy HA1 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan (Part 1) 2018, Policies DM20 and DM22 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan (Part 2) 2023 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2023.

Informatives:

1. This listed building consent should be read in conjunction with the decision notice for full planning permission ref. WA/2024/00461.